

Adobe Inc. (ADBE) EQ Review

Current EQ Rating*	Previous EQ Rating
4+	na

6- "Exceptionally Strong"
5- "Strong"
4- "Acceptable"
3- "Minor Concern"
2- "Weak"
1- "Strong Concerns"

Note that a "+" sign indicates the earnings quality improved in the most recent quarter while a "-" sign indicates deterioration

*For an explanation of the EQ Review Rating scale, please refer to the end of this report

We initiate earnings quality coverage with a 4+ (Acceptable) rating

Overall, we see ADBE's earnings quality as currently being solid. We have the following observations and identification of the key accounting-based factors driving earnings.

- ADBE has been shifting sales to Cloud-based services and away from on-premises licenses for years. This has led to an increase in the portion of the company's revenues generated by subscription agreements which now stands at over 90% and climbing. Ordinarily, one would expect to see deferred revenue days of sales increase as a result of a larger percentage of revenues being deferred rather than recognized upfront. However, ADBE's deferred revenue days have instead been declining YOY for the last several quarters. This would ordinarily be a classic red flag possibly indicating aggressive revenue recognition or a pending slowdown in revenue growth. However, ADBE's contracts are far from homogenous with varying time frames and billing patterns. Shifts in the type of contract being signed can have a meaningful impact on deferred revenue trends.
- In the last two quarters, the company attributed the muted increase in deferred revenue to the fact that the COVID environment shifted sales to its Adobe.com

platform which are billed monthly and away from traditional channel sales which are billed annually. This is a reasonable explanation. However, the company did not give explanations in the conference calls or SEC filings for the decline in deferred revenue days seen in the two pre-COVID quarters which raises some questions. Were it not for our questions on weaker deferred revenue growth in those quarters, we would have rated the company's earnings quality a 5 (Strong). Looking forward, strong ARR trends confirm the company's booking of new business is strong, so we are not concerned that the deferred revenue trends in the last two quarters indicate increased aggressiveness in revenue recognition or are signaling a slowdown in revenue growth. We will be watching for deferred revenue growth to trend upwards as conditions return to normal and sales shift back to regular channels.

- ADBE adds back stock-based compensation to its non-GAAP results which is typical in the tech industry. Stock-based compensation has been trending at around 17% of non-GAAP operating income. While less than some of the big software peers we have reviewed, this is still a sizeable portion of total expenses being ignored by investors focusing on non-GAAP earnings. Also, stock-based compensation has been increasing so the exclusion of the expense is benefitting non-GAAP growth.
- The company also adds back amortization of acquired intangibles to non-GAAP figures. While ADBE made a large acquisition in 2018, it is not relying on acquisitions to fuel growth. Intangibles amortization is declining as older intangibles become fully amortized and the expense is now down to just over 6% of non-GAAP operating profits. Excluding amortization is actually penalizing non-GAAP growth at this point.
- ADBE capitalizes the costs to obtain contracts (mainly commissions) as required and amortizes the balance over an estimated benefit period of 5 years. This assumed benefit period seems reasonable and compares favorably to the assumed benefit period for several peers. The company does not disclose periodic capitalization of costs or the associated amortization expense on the balance which would be helpful. However, the ending balance of capitalized costs regularly hovers around 15 days of sales which reduces the concern of any artificially benefit related to the account. In addition, we note that assuming a five-year amortization period, we estimate quarterly amortization expense is only between 4-5 cps compared to the non-GAAP earnings figure of \$2.57 in the 8/20 quarter, making this a relatively immaterial issue.

Revenue Breakdown

ADBE reports revenue under three operating segments: Digital Media, Digital Experience, and Publishing. Growth for each one of these segments is shown in the table below for the last eight quarters:

Table 1

	8/28/2020	5/29/2020	2/28/2020	11/29/2019
Digital Media	\$2,337	\$2,232	\$2,169	\$2,078
growth	19.1%	18.1%	22.1%	21.5%
Digital Experience	\$838	\$826	\$858	\$859
growth	2.1%	5.4%	15.5%	24.5%
Publishing	\$50	\$70	\$64	\$55
growth	-2.0%	0.0%	-21.0%	-15.4%
Total	\$3,225	\$3,128	\$3,091	\$2,992
growth	13.8%	14.0%	18.8%	21.4%

	8/30/2019	5/31/2019	3/01/2019	11/30/2018
Digital Media	\$1,962	\$1,890	\$1,777	\$1,710
growth	21.9%	22.3%	21.6%	23.0%
Digital Experience	\$821	\$784	\$743	\$690
growth	33.7%	33.8%	34.1%	25.5%
Publishing	\$51	\$70	\$81	\$65
growth	-25.0%	11.1%	26.6%	-1.5%
Total	\$2,834	\$2,744	\$2,601	\$2,465
growth	23.7%	25.0%	25.1%	22.9%

Digital Media

Over 70% of ADBE's revenue comes from its Digital Media segment. The bulk of Digital Media consists of the *Adobe Creative Cloud* which accounts for more than 80% of Digital Media revenue. This is a subscription service that offers access to products such as *Photoshop*, *Illustrator*, and *Lightroom*. These products are used by creative professionals such as artists, designers, web developers and other content generators to produce printed content and online graphic and video content.

Digital Media also includes *Document Cloud* which accounts for the remained of Digital Media revenue. These products are built around the *Acrobat* and *Acrobat Reader* platforms for document creation coupled with the *Adobe Sign* and *Adobe Scan* document service

products. These products are used for everything from invoicing, contract creation, compliance, and reporting.

We see above that Digital Media revenue has been in the 20% range. This has been driven largely by growth in new users with recent growth being boosted by the jump people working from home in the COVID environment.

The bulk of Digital Media revenue is sold as a subscription with cash received upfront and recognized over time. The company presents Annualized Recurring Revenue for the segment which is the annual value of all subscription-based contracts in effect at the end of the period.

Table 2

	8/28/2020	5/29/2020	2/28/2020	11/29/2019	8/30/2019
Creative ARR	\$8,294	\$7,934	\$7,582	\$7,253	\$6,866
	20.8%				
Document Cloud ARR	\$1,339	\$1,241	\$1,150	\$1,079	\$993
	34.8%				
Total Digital Media ARR	\$9,633	\$9,175	\$8,732	\$8,332	\$7,859

We can see that both *Creative Cloud* and *Document Cloud* ARR figures are showing strong growth trends both YOY and sequentially.

Digital Experience

The Digital Experience segment accounts for about 25% of total company revenue. ADBE's Digital Experience segment addresses the need for companies to perform customer data analytics, content delivery, campaign design, and advertising activities. Its *Adobe Experience Cloud* platform includes products such as *Analytics*, *Audience Manager*, *Experience Manager*, *Campaign*, and *Advertising Cloud*. We see from Table 1 above that growth in the segment has slowed dramatically in the last few quarters. The decline in growth in the last two quarters was largely due to the company discontinuing its transaction-driven *Advertising Cloud* offerings in the 5/20 quarter. After adjustment for *Advertising Cloud*, Digital Experience revenue growth was 14% in the 8/20 quarter.

Publishing

Publishing is the smallest segment at less than 2% of total revenue and declining. This segment includes the company's legacy *PostScript* and *PDF* printing technologies.

Ongoing Move to Subscription Model

ADBE has been moving its software to a Cloud-based service model for years with currently 93% of revenue being generated in subscription form. The following table shows the percentage of each segment's revenue that is generated from a subscription Cloud-based service:

Table 3

	8/28/2020	5/29/2020	2/28/2020	11/29/2019
% of Digital Media That Is Subscription	95.8%	95.7%	94.9%	92.9%
% of Digital Experience That Is Subscription	87.0%	85.6%	86.1%	84.5%
% of Publishing That Is Subscription	62.0%	45.7%	43.8%	55.2%
Total	93.0%	91.9%	91.4%	89.8%

	8/30/2019	5/31/2019	3/01/2019	11/30/2018
% of Digital Media That Is Subscription	93.8%	93.9%	93.6%	93.6%
% of Digital Experience That Is Subscription	82.7%	83.4%	82.4%	80.3%
% of Publishing That Is Subscription	52.9%	40.0%	35.8%	45.5%
Total	89.9%	89.5%	88.6%	88.6%

Note that all three segments are seeing their revenue mixes shift to subscription-based models.

Despite the Shift to Subscriptions, Deferred Revenue Days of Sales Are Declining

ADBE offers its products on a subscription basis, on-premises/on device license basis, and per-usage basis. Revenue from subscription customers is recognized ratably over the term of agreements "generally ranging from 1 to 36 months." As shown above, subscription revenue comprises about 93% of revenue. On-premises products are generally recognized at the time of sale. Product revenue amounted to 3.4% of revenue in the latest quarter and is steadily declining. All else equal, such a mix shift would lead us to expect a gradual rise

in deferred revenue days of sales as a greater percentage of new revenue signed would be deferred each quarter. However, ADBE's contracts are far from homogenous as the wide range of contract time frames, from 1-36 months, would suggest. Consider the company's discussion of its revenue recognition policies from the 11/19 10-K:

*“Our contracts with customers may include multiple goods and services. For example, some of our offerings include both on-premise and/or on-device software licenses and cloud services. Determining whether the software licenses and the cloud services are distinct from each other, and therefore performance obligations to be accounted for separately, or not distinct from each other, and therefore part of a single performance obligation, may require significant judgment. **We have concluded that the on-premise/on-device software licenses and cloud services provided in our Creative Cloud and Document Cloud subscription offerings are not distinct from each other such that revenue from each offering should be recognized ratably over the subscription period for which the cloud services are provided.** In reaching this conclusion, we considered the nature of our promise to Creative Cloud and Document Cloud customers, which is to provide a complete end-to-end creative design or document workflow solution that operates seamlessly across multiple devices and teams. We fulfill this promise by providing access to a solution that integrates cloud-based and on-premise/on-device features that, together through their integration, provide functionalities, utility and workflow efficiencies that could not be obtained from either the on-premise/on-device software or cloud services on their own.*

Cloud-hosted subscription services may be sold on a fee-per-subscription period basis or based on consumption or usage.

We recognize revenue ratably over the contractual service term for hosted services that are priced based on a committed number of transactions where the delivery and consumption of the benefit of the services occur evenly over time, beginning on the date the services associated with the committed transactions are first made available to the customer and continuing through the end of the contractual service term. Over-usage fees and fees based on the actual number of transactions are billed in accordance with contract terms as these fees are incurred and are included in the transaction price of an arrangement as variable consideration. Fees based on a number of transactions or impressions per month, where invoicing is aligned to the pattern of performance, customer benefit and consumption, are typically accounted for utilizing the “as-invoiced” practical expedient. Revenue for subscriptions sold as

a fee per period is recognized ratably over the contractual term as the customer simultaneously receives and consumes the benefit of the underlying service.

The above quote would indicate that while some usage-based contracts could potentially skew the mix of deferred revenue, it seems the overwhelming majority of the subscription business is booked ratably. However, deferred revenue patterns will also be impacted by the timing of billings, as the company points out:

“The deferred revenue balance is influenced by several factors, including seasonality, the compounding effects of renewals, invoice duration, invoice timing, size and new business linearity within the quarter. “

The following table shows the calculation of the company’s deferred revenue days of sales for the last 12 quarters. Note that we use Subscription plus Service & Support sales in our calculation and exclude product revenue as those revenues are recognized upfront.

Table 4

	8/28/2020	5/29/2020	2/28/2020	11/29/2019
Subscription Revenue	\$3,000	\$2,874	\$2,825	\$2,687
Services & Support Revenue	\$116	\$126	\$123	\$138
Subscription and Service & Support Revenue	\$3,116	\$3,000	\$2,948	\$2,825
Total Deferred Revenue	\$3,448	\$3,461	\$3,614	\$3,501
Total Deferred Revenue Days of Sales	100.7	105.0	111.6	112.8
	8/30/2019	5/31/2019	3/01/2019	11/30/2018
Subscription Revenue	\$2,547	\$2,456	\$2,305	\$2,184
Services & Support Revenue	\$130	\$135	\$125	\$130
Subscription and Service & Support Revenue	\$2,677	\$2,591	\$2,430	\$2,314
Total Deferred Revenue	\$3,256	\$3,135	\$3,218	\$3,054
Total Deferred Revenue Days of Sales	110.7	110.1	120.5	120.1
	08/31/2018	06/01/2018	03/02/2018	12/01/2017
Subscription Revenue	\$2,022	\$1,923	\$1,793	\$1,696
Services & Support Revenue	\$120	\$121	\$114	\$118
Subscription and Service & Support Revenue	\$2,142	\$2,044	\$1,907	\$1,814
Total Deferred Revenue	\$2,707	\$2,634	\$2,573	\$2,495
Total Deferred Revenue Days of Sales	115.0	117.3	122.8	125.2

We can see in the table that deferred revenue days of sales have been declining YOY for the last several quarters. The company mentions in the 11/19 10-K that significant movements in deferred revenue during fiscal 2019 were partly due to deferred revenue balances picked up in acquisitions. During the 11/18 quarter, ADBE bought Marketo which resulted in the booking of \$74 million in deferred revenue at the close of the deal. We do not see any significant YOY change in deferred revenue days in the 11/18 or 3/19 quarter, so we doubt the Marketo acquisition had much of an impact on the comparison.

In the 3/19 quarter, the company bought the remaining interests in Allegorithmic for \$106.2 million. Only about \$9 million of the purchase price was allocated to all of net liabilities (where deferred revenue would be booked) so we doubt that had any meaningful disruption of comparisons.

Nevertheless, we begin to see an accelerating year-over-year decline in deferred revenue days of sales beginning in the 5/19 quarter. We saw no explanation for any depression of deferred revenue in conference call transcripts or SEC filings for the 11/19 or 2/20 quarters. However, the company noted in the last two quarters which were impacted by COVID that it saw a significant shift in sales to its online Adobe.com platform and away from its traditional channel revenue. Here is the explanation of the shift from the 8/20 quarter conference call:

“Deferred Revenue exiting the quarter was \$3.45 billion. As I mentioned last quarter, our Adobe.com offerings, typically billed monthly, are reported as unbilled backlog, whereas channel offerings billed annually up front are reported as deferred revenue. The strength in acquisition on Adobe.com during the quarter continues to drive a mix-shift from deferred revenue to unbilled backlog.”

This is a reasonable explanation for the slowdown in the growth of deferred revenue relative to sales growth and new business growth trends are strong. We are therefore not alarmed that the slowdown in deferred revenue growth represents the company becoming more aggressive in recognizing revenue or that it is foreshadowing a slowdown in revenue growth. Should the shift towards Adobe.com sales from channel sales hold until COVID subsides, we can expect to see more YOY declines in deferred revenue days. However, when that day comes, if we don't see a rebound deferred revenue growth, it will become a point of concern.

Non-GAAP Analysis

As is typical for tech companies, ADBE adds back both stock-based compensation and amortization of intangibles assets to its non-GAAP numbers. The following table shows these add-backs as a percentage of non-GAAP operating profit:

Table 5

	8/28/2020	5/29/2020	2/28/2020	11/29/2019
Adjusted Operating Income	\$1,403	\$1,335	\$1,245	\$1,274
Stock-Based and Deferred Compensation	\$244	\$227	\$214	\$208
% of Adjusted Operating Income	17.4%	17.0%	17.2%	16.3%
Amortization of Intangibles	\$90	\$92	\$94	\$96
% of Adjusted Operating Income	6.4%	6.9%	7.6%	7.5%

	8/30/2019	5/31/2019	3/01/2019	11/30/2018
Adjusted Operating Income	\$1,153	\$1,050	\$985	\$953
Stock-Based and Deferred Compensation	\$199	\$204	\$187	\$166
% of Adjusted Operating Income	17.3%	19.4%	19.0%	17.4%
Amortization of Intangibles	\$100	\$96	\$103	\$66
% of Adjusted Operating Income	8.7%	9.1%	10.5%	6.9%

Stock-based compensation as a percentage of adjusted operating profit is holding fairly steady at 17-20%. While not as large as a percentage of adjusted profits as salesforce.com (CRM) and Autodesk (ADSK) which are closer to 40%, stock compensation is still a material part of operating expenses that is being ignored by investors who focus on the non-GAAP results alone. The rationale for excluding the expense is that it is non-cash in nature. However, we counter that if the company did not pay this compensation in stock, it would have had to pay a similar amount in cash, not to mention that the company will have to spend cash to repurchase shares to avoid diluting shareholders.

ADBE is not overly acquisitive. However, in October of 2018, it spent \$4.7 billion acquiring Marketo. About 73% of the purchase price was booked as goodwill and will never be amortized. However, amortization expense is declining as intangible assets are becoming fully amortized so ironically, non-GAAP profit growth is actually being penalized by excluding amortization expense. We disagree with ignoring the amortization of acquired intangibles as it ignores the cost of the deals, but since the company is not relying on

acquisitions to generate growth, we are not as concerned by amortization expense as we are with some companies.

Besides stock compensation and amortization of intangibles, the only other regular non-GAAP adjustments the company makes is to zero out the effect of investment gains and losses. This is a reasonable adjustment and the amounts are typically immaterial.

Capitalized Costs to Obtain Contracts

ADBE is required to capitalize the costs to obtain contracts which include expenses such as commissions. These costs are amortized over the estimated period of time over which the company will benefit from the customer relationship which is currently 5 years. As is typical, when the benefit period is assumed to be less than one year, the company expenses the costs immediately. We note that the 5-year assumed benefit period is substantially less than the 10 years used by Paycom Software (PAYC) and more in-line with the 3-5 years used by Citrix Systems (CTXS) and 4 years used by salesforce.com (CRM). We therefore do not take issue with the company's choice of a benefit period.

ADBE does not disclose the amount of costs capitalized during the period or the periodic amortization expense associated with capitalized contract costs which would be helpful in getting a clearer picture of this account. However, it does disclose the ending balance of capitalized contract costs which tracks closely from quarter to quarter at around 15 days of sales. Therefore, with the information given, we do not see evidence that the company is artificially benefitting from changes in the account. Furthermore, the balance of capitalized contract costs was \$538 million at the end of the 8/20 quarter. Quarterly amortization of that amount over 5 years would only be about 4.5 cps versus the non-GAAP EPS figure of \$2.57 making this a relatively immaterial issue.

Explanation of EQ Rating Scale

6- "Exceptionally Strong"	Indicates uncommonly conservative accounting policies to the point that revenue and earnings are essentially understated relative to the company's peers. Higher possibility of reporting positive earnings surprises
5- "Strong"	Indicates the company has no areas of concern with its reported results and we see very little risk of the company disappointing due to recent results being overstated from aggressive reporting in recent periods.
4- "Acceptable"	Indicates the company may have exhibited a minor "red flag", but the severity of the issue is not yet a concern. Minimal risk of an earnings disappointment resulting from previous earnings or cash flow overstatement
3- "Minor Concern"	Indicates the company has exhibited either a larger number of or more serious warning signs than companies receiving a 4. The likelihood of an immediate earnings or cash flow disappointment is not considered to be high, but the signs mentioned deserve a higher degree of attention in the future.
2- "Weak"	Indicates the company's recently reported results have benefitted materially from aggressive accounting. Follow up work should be performed to determine the nature and extent of the problem. There is a possibility that upcoming results could disappoint as the impact of unsustainable benefits disappears.
1- "Strong Concerns"	Indicates that the company's recent results are significantly overstated and that we view a disappointment in upcoming quarters is highly likely.

In addition to the numerical rating, the EQ Review Rating may also include either a minus or plus sign. A minus sign indicates that our analysis shows the overall earnings quality of the company has worsened since the last review and there is a possibility the numerical rating will fall should the problem continue into the next quarter. Likewise, a positive sign indicates that the overall earnings quality is improving, and the company may see an upgrade in its numerical rating should the trend continue.

Key Points to Understand About the EQ Score

The EQ Review Rating is much more than a blind, quantitative scoring method. While we utilize proprietary adjustments, ratios, and methods developed over decades of earnings quality analysis, the foundation of all of our analysis is reading recent SEC filings, press releases, conference call transcripts and in some cases, conversations with managements.

The EQ Review Rating is not comparable to a traditional buy/sell rating. The Rating is intended to specifically convey the extent to which reported earnings may be over/understated. Fundamental factors such as forecasts for future growth, increasing competition, and valuation are not reflected in the rating. Therefore, a high score does not in itself indicate a company is a buy but rather indicates that recent results are a good indication of the underlying earnings and cash generation capacity of the company. A low score (1-2) will likely result in us performing a more thorough review of fundamental factors to determine if the company warrants a full-blown sell recommendation.

Disclosure

Behind the Numbers, LLC is an independent research firm structured to provide analytical research to the financial community. Behind the Numbers, LLC is not rendering investment advice based on investment portfolios and is not registered as an investment adviser in any jurisdiction. All research is based on fundamental analysis using publicly available information including SEC filed documents, company presentations, annual reports, earnings call transcripts, as well as those of competitors, customers, and suppliers. Other information sources include mass market and industry news resources. These sources are believed to be reliable, but no representation is made that they are accurate or complete, or that errors, if discovered, will be corrected. Behind the Numbers, LLC does not use company sources beyond what they have publicly written or discussed in presentations or media interviews. Behind the Numbers does not use or subscribe to expert networks. All employees are aware of this policy and adhere to it.

The authors of this report have not audited the financial statements of the companies discussed and do not represent that they are serving as independent public accountants with respect to them. They have not audited the statements and therefore do not express an opinion on them. Other CPAs, unaffiliated with Mr. Middleswart, may or may not have audited the financial statements. The authors also have not conducted a thorough "review" of the financial statements as defined by standards established by the AICPA.

This report is not intended, and shall not constitute, and nothing contained herein shall be construed as, an offer to sell or a solicitation of an offer to buy any securities referred to in this report, or a "BUY" or "SELL" recommendation. Rather, this research is intended to identify issues that investors should be aware of for them to assess their own opinion of positive or negative potential.

Behind the Numbers, LLC, its employees, its affiliated entities, and the accounts managed by them may have a position in, and from time-to-time purchase or sell any of the securities mentioned in this report. Initial positions will not be taken by any of the aforementioned parties until after the report is distributed to clients, unless otherwise disclosed. It is possible that a position could be held by Behind the Numbers, LLC, its employees, its affiliated entities, and the accounts managed by them for stocks that are mentioned in an update, or a BTN Thursday Thoughts.

